

Rhode Island State Planning Council
Approved Minutes of Thursday, October 9, 2014 Meeting
William E. Powers Building
Conference Room A
One Capitol Hill, Providence, RI

I. ATTENDANCE

1. Members Present

Mr. Kevin Flynn, Secretary	Associate Director, Division of Planning
Ms. Ana Cano-Morales	Public Member
Ms. Barbara Cesaro	Representing Ms. Marion Gold, Director, RI Office of Energy Resources
Ms. Janet Coit	Director, RIDEM
Mr. Michael Fine	Director RI Department of Health
Mr. Ruben Flores-Marzan	Planning Director, Providence Department of Planning and Development
Ms. Elizabeth Leach	Representing Mr. Thomas Mullaney, RI Department of Administration, Budget Office
Mr. Marcus Mitchell	Small Business Representative
Mr. L. Vincent Murray	RILOCAT, Government Official Representative
Ms. Lilly Picchione	Representing Mr. Raymond Studley, RIPTA
Ms. Amy Rainone	Representing Mr. Richard Godfrey, Executive Director Rhode Island Housing
Mr. Jan Reitsma	Governor's Policy Office
Mr. M. James Riordan	Public Member
Mr. Peder Schaefer	Representing Mr. Daniel Beardsley, Executive Director, RILOCAT
Mr. Samuel Shamoon	Governor's Designee
Mr. Bob Shawver	Representing Mr. Michael Lewis, Director, RI Department of Transportation
Mr. Michael Walker	Representing Mr. Marcel Valois, Executive Director, Commerce RI
Ms. Janet White-Raymond	Public Member
Mr. Scott Wolf	Environmental Advocate

2. Members Absent

Ms. Jeanne Boyle	President's Designee, RILOCAT
Ms. Jeanne Cola	Chair, RI Housing Resources Commission
Ms. Sharon Conard-Wells	West Elmwood Housing Development Corporation
Mr. Roy Coulombe	Public Member
Mr. Grover Fugate	Executive Director, RI Coastal Resources Management Council
Mr. Steven Hartford, Chair	Director of Administration

Mr. John Trevor

Environmental Advocate

3. Guests

Mr. Corey Bobba

Federal Highway Administration

Mr. Terry Gray

RI Department of Environmental Management

Mr. Mike McGonagle

RI Resource Recovery Corporation

Mr. Mike O'Connell

RI Resource Recovery Corporation

4. Staff – Division of Planning

Ms. Nancy Hess

Statewide Planning

Mr. Paul Gonsalves

Statewide Planning

Mr. Jared Rhodes

Chief, Statewide Planning Program

Ms. Dawn Vittorioso

Executive Assistant, Division of Planning

II. AGENDA ITEMS

1. Call to Order

Mr. Flynn in Director Hartford's absence and at his request called the meeting to order on October 9, 2014 at 9:06 a.m.

2. Approval of the August 28, 2014 & September 25, 2014 Meeting Minutes – *for vote*

Mr. Flynn asked for a motion to approve the meeting minutes of August 28, 2014 & September 25, 2014. Ms. White-Raymond moved to approve the minutes of August 28, 2014 & September 25, 2014 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Walker. The following members voted aye Cano-Morales, Cesaro, Coit, Fine, Flores-Marzan, Flynn, Leach, Mitchell, Murray, Picchione, Rainone, Reitsma, Riordan, Schaefer, Shamoan, Shawver, Walker, White-Raymond, and Wolf all voted to approve. There were no nay votes, abstentions or further discussion.

3. Public Comment on Agenda Items

There were none.

4. Rhode Island Comprehensive Solid Waste Management Plan Update – *for action*

Mr. Flynn next introduced RI Resource Recovery's (RIRRC) Executive Director, Mr. Mike O'Connell who delivered the presentation included as attachment 1. Instances where the Council engaged in discussion are summarized as follows:

Ms. Coit noted that from the RI Department of Environmental Management's (RIDEM) perspective, the funding concerns expressed are paramount and need to be addressed. She said that the state should find means for incentivizing the reduction in solid waste generation. Ms. Coit supported the Plan and said that extending the

life of the landfill is critical and that Pay As You Throw (PAYT) is a worthy option to discuss for addressing all of these concerns.

Mr. Shamoon questioned the RI League of Cities and Town's position on the PAYT proposal. In response, Mr. Schaefer indicated that there are concerns at the municipal level regarding the change in direction from an automated collection to a PAYT system but indicated that these concerns might be able to be addressed through project design and further education.

Mr. Riordan said that the PAYT system makes good sense but stated that the average resident will want to see a reduction in their tax rate. He said that although this will be difficult politically, the education component and discussions need to begin. Mr. Riordan then asked whether cost savings have been estimated per household. Mr. O'Connell indicated that initial estimates project the PAYT cost at \$10 per month, per household. Mr. Riordan next inquired if there will be a complete offset in the cost as well as the savings. Mr. O'Connell said not completely, but noted that RIRRC is working to better quantify that information.

Mr. Murray noted that the "devil is in the details" and said that a lot of attention will need to be spent municipality by municipality in properly designing a program that will be acceptable to all. Mr. O'Connell agreed that this will be needed and said that it is the intent of the Corporation to work with the municipalities in addressing specific operational concerns on a case-by-case basis.

Ms. Coit emphasized that she supports using cost in a way that changes behavior to extend the life of the landfill. She pointed out that the next alternative is going to be tremendously expensive to develop compared to what is in place now. Mr. O'Connell agreed and noted that RI's other alternatives are far more expensive than the current \$32 tipping rate, which itself doesn't accurately reflect the true disposal cost.

Mr. Wolf asked what the context is that generally facilitates approval of PAYT programs. Mr. McGonagle said it is generally related to regulatory/fiscal concerns. Mr. Wolf next pointed out that the two RI communities that are using PAYT programs, Middletown and Tiverton, have low poverty rates and asked how PAYT programs can be successful in communities with higher poverty rates. In response, Mr. McGonagle said that there are programmatic means for dealing with those types of concerns and that RIRRC would be paying particular attention to them in investigating and developing a RI program.

Mr. Walker indicated that the state needs to be thoughtful on what the impact to the business community will be. Mr. McGonagle stated that the Corporation is paying attention to this but that the, overall, impact of residential PAYT should be minimal. Mr. Reitsma agreed with Mr. Walker's comment but said that being proactive could also benefit RI as businesses would see that RI is cognizant to address the issue with a solution. He then noted that the real challenge will be developing a communications program that accurately and efficiently educates on the realities of the challenges, impacts and benefits of a potential PAYT program. In conclusion, he said that this is a controversial issue and a discussion that has to move forward. Mr. O'Connell agreed that a robust communications strategy will be needed.

Mr. Riordan questioned whether there are any important solid waste challenges that residents are currently facing that could be addressed through an education platform. Mr. O'Connell said that communicating the realities of where we are at with solid waste disposal is the most important.

Mr. Wolf asked if any other state has adopted a PAYT program. Mr. McGonagle said that there isn't but

Mr. O'Connell noted that there are 7,000 other municipalities and counties in the country that have.

Ms. Rainone stated that the PAYT program may make the most sense but reiterated that there are certain segments of our population that will require "best practices" in order to achieve success and suggested having examples of communities across the country that have dealt with those types of issues and explain how they were addressed. Mr. O'Connell agreed and said that RIRRC plans to bring such examples to its design.

Mr. Reitsma asked whether a centralized collection system would still focus on the Johnston location.

Mr. O'Connell indicated that it would since that is where the processing capacity now exists and will remain.

Ms. Coit pointed out that actions relative to producer responsibility is a large issue that is also being addressed on a regional level.

Mr. Fine referred to food waste diversion and questioned whether this could be an opportunity from a health perspective for RIDOH to work with RIRRC in not only educating the public about what to do with food waste but to also educate the public as to the types and amounts of food that should be consumed. Mr. Reitsma added that there is an economic development component that could be related to food diversion, composting and recycling.

Mr. Wolf asked if RIRRC could get all of the mentioned strategies in place, how long would it extend the life of the landfill. Mr. O'Connell said it could potentially extend it to the year 2072 if you excluded commercial waste and pursued the PAYT program.

There being no further discussion Mr. Flynn asked for a motion to authorize the conducting of a public hearing on the draft update. Mr. Flores-Marzan motioned to authorize the conducting of a public hearing on the draft Rhode Island Comprehensive Solid Waste Management Plan. The motion was seconded by Mr. Wolf. The following member voted Aye Cano-Morales, Cesaro, Coit, Fine, Flores-Marzan, Flynn, Leach, Mitchell, Murray, Rainone, Reitsma, Riordan, Schaefer, Shamoon, Shawver, White-Raymond and Wolf all voted to approve. There were no nay votes, abstentions or further discussion. At this point representatives, Walker and Picchione were not present to vote.

5. **Proposed 2015 Meeting Schedule** – *for discussion*

Mr. Flynn presented the proposed 2015 meeting schedule for informational purposes. He said that two meetings are scheduled in January and February and noted that the additional meetings will be for the review of RhodeMap RI's draft Housing Plan. He concluded by saying that the schedule will be presented at next month's meeting for action.

6. **Associate Director's Report**

Mr. Flynn addressed the following items under the Associate Director's report:

- RhodeMap RI Economic Development Plan public hearings schedule;
- RhodeMap RI Draft Housing Plan status;

Dr. Fine pointed out that RIDOH has been tasked with writing a State Healthcare Plan and said that he would like to discuss whether the State Healthcare Plan could play a role in the State Guide Plan. Mr. Flynn welcomed the discussion and then continued delivering additional items under the Associate Director's report:

- Southern New England American Planning Association conference;
- Janet White-Raymond's recognition event from the University of Rhode Island on October 25th.

7. **Other Business**

Mr. Riordan noted that although online registration is closed, walk-in registration to the Southern New England American Planning Association conference will be accepted at the door.

Mr. Wolf announced that GrowSmart issued its 2014 Briefing Book for Candidates and Voters. The book can be viewed on the GrowSmart website (www.growsmartri.org). Mr. Wolf next announced that GrowSmart and the Providence Preservation Society are co-sponsoring a talk by former Cincinnati Mayor, Mark Mallory on November 6th at 5:30 p.m., and it will be held at the Industrial Trust Building (Superman Building).

8. **Adjourn**

There being no further discussion, Council member Shamoon motioned to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Council member White-Raymond. The following members voted aye Cano-Morales, Cesaro, Coit, Fine, Flores-Marzan, Flynn, Mitchell, Leach, Murray, Rainone, Reitsma, Riordan, Schaefer, Shawver, Shamoon, White-Raymond and Wolf, all voted to approve. There were no nay votes, abstentions or further discussion. Representatives, Walker and Picchione were not present to vote. The meeting adjourned at 10:15 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,



Kevin Flynn
Secretary

Attachment 1



Statewide Solid Waste Plan State Planning Council Update

October 9, 2014

Michael OConnell, Executive Director
Rhode Island Resource Recovery Corporation

**Recycling.
Make it second nature.**

Covered in Prior Reviews

- Solid Waste Volumes by Sector/Type
- Recycling/Diversion Experience
- Key Business Trends
- Financial Trends
- The Funding Dilemma
- Near Term/Long Term Strategic Options
- Potential Impacts: Financial and Environmental

Today's Update

- Evolution of the Plan
- Key Issues
- Recommended Actions

Evolution of the Plan

- Fixing the funding issue seen as a prerequisite to implementing new programs to extend landfill life.
- Two fundamental choices to solve funding:
 - PAYT
 - Raise municipal rates
- Importance of acting aggressively as time is running out.
- Soon, RI will need to decide on the best disposal option to replace the Central Landfill when it eventually closes.

Actions

Action	Responsible Agents	Date	Type
<p>Design & consider implementation of a mandated RIRRC managed statewide PAYT program.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Design a model program - Identify stakeholders, and prepare impact assessments - Identify and recommend statutory required statutory revisions - Develop and rules and procedures for program <p><u>Pending approval by RIRRC Board:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RFP for bag vendor - Implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consider future programs for offering PAYT to small businesses and commercial housing, limited to some predetermined amount of weekly waste generated. 	RIRRC, Muni, DEM	2015-17	L, P, R
<p>Identify alternative models for RIRRC governance that clarify the relationship between RIRRC and municipalities in order to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Set fees - Determine distribution and amount of revenue sharing of disposal and recycling revenues 	RIRRC	2015-2017	P, L, R
<p>Consider centralized management of recycling collection services.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Working group to design system - Identify required statutory revisions and advocate for adoption - Develop and adopt governing rules and procedures - RFP for collection services - Implementation 	RIRRC	2015-2017	P, L, R

Action	Responsible Agents	Date	Type
<p>Consider centralized management of recycling collection services.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Working group to design system - Identify required statutory revisions and advocate for adoption - Develop and adopt governing rules and procedures - RFP for collection services - Implementation 	RIRRC	2015-2017	P, L, R
<p>Commence a Waste Characterization study for RI generated solid waste that identifies the contents of the waste by commercial/municipal/transfer station segments, seasonality, and waste type. Study begins in the summer of 2014 and will be completed by the fall of 2015. The study will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identify waste stream contents by discrete source necessary to justify funding programs to reduce land filling of solid waste - Identify additional opportunities to increase collection of recyclable materials - Set realistic targets for curbside recycling programs - Update for solid waste market changes (last study was 1990) 	RIRRC	2015	S
<p>Implement statutory changes requiring adherence to maximum commercial sector disposal targets at the Central Landfill.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identify required statutory revisions - develop recommended Statute and rules - implement 	RIRRC, DEM	2015-16	L, P, R

Action	Responsible Agents	Date	Type
Identify and work with underperforming municipalities on removing the barriers preventing capture of recyclable materials.	RIRRC, Muni	2015	P
Using results of the Waste Characterization Study (see above), to implement programs to prevent mistakenly disposed of recyclable materials.	RIRRC, Muni	2015-16	P
Expand Producer Responsibility legislation to include tires, carpet, unwanted medications/sharps, batteries, CFLs, and paper and packaging.	DEM	2015-16	L
Improve paper and packaging recycling in the commercial sector through improved reporting and outreach.	DEM	2015-16	P
Support food waste diversion in the commercial sector through policies, regulations, and statutes that encourage development of private processing. -Develop /adopt rules for large scale commercial food scrap generators. -Implementation	DEM, RIRRC	Ongoing	P
Support food waste diversion in the residential sector through at-home and community based food waste composting. -Revise rules for small scale composting operations	DEM, RIRRC	Ongoing	P
Continue to provide public education services and technical assistance to the commercial and municipal sectors.	DEM,RIRRC	Ongoing	P
Employ new and expanded public outreach tools such as social media to encourage waste reduction and recycling. - Encourage co-ops among businesses in underserved neighborhoods and office parks to leverage buying power over waste haulers.	DEM, RIRRC	Ongoing	P
Identify underperforming municipal and school programs and provide assistance to upgrade. - Consider how to offer free collection of paper and other fiber from schools not serviced by municipalities provided that the paper is separated into colored/newspaper and office paper.	RIRRC, DEM	Ongoing	P

Action	Responsible Agents	Date	Type
Design evaluation work and secure experts needed to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Examine all alternatives for solid waste prevention, recycling, processing, conversion technologies, and collection systems that can be used as a long-term solution for solid waste disposal; - Assess potential for exporting RI municipal waste out of state for processing or disposal; - Assess the potential for future landfill expansion in Rhode Island. 	RIRRC	2015	S
Solid waste options evaluation completed/*option(s) selected.	RIRRC	2017	S
Convene Advisory Committee for advice.	RIRRC	2018	S
Solid Waste Management SGP and SDP Updated	RIRRC, DOP	2019	S
Modify enabling legislation if necessary	RIRRC	2020	L
Begin Implementation/Construction	RIRRC	2021	P
Continue air quality monitoring at the Central Landfill	RIRRC, DEM	2014	R